



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/586,098	03/20/2007	Mikhail Laksin	S9025.0219	1736
32172	7590	12/24/2009		
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP				
1633 Broadway				
NEW YORK, NY 10019				
EXAMINER				
SHAH, MANISH S				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
2853				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
12/24/2009		PAPER		

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Response to Arguments

1. Applicant's arguments filed 12/03/2009 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Applicant argued that there is no teaching or suggestion in Subbaraman reference of the presence of an energy curable monomer, oligomer or mixture, which is not persuasive. However, examiner used Subbaraman as secondary reference not as primary reference, the primary reference Ylitalo clearly discloses in paragraph [0093] that the ink composition comprises polymerizable and/or crosslinkable multifunctional monomer and oligomers.
2. Applicant argued that there must be some reason to extract some teaching from secondary reference and incorporate it into the primary reference, the office action does not propose such reason, which is not persuasive. The secondary reference Subbaraman et al. clearly teaches in abstract that "The quantities of resin are chosen according to the desired viscosity, adhesion strength." and which gives image with high opacity with high contrast and good adhesion. This proper reason to incorporate the solvent soluble resin. Therefore combination of the references are still reads on the present claimed invention. Examiner used Subbaraman et al. to show that it is known to use solvent soluble resin used in ink composition, and applicant invention is also printing ink, so it is proper to combine the references.

Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Manish S. Shah whose telephone number is (571) 272-2152. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00am-4:30pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Stephen D. Meier can be reached on (571) 272-2149. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Manish S. Shah/
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 2853

/MSS/